RECEIVED by Michigan Court of Appeals 7/26/2013 3:29:51 PM

Lower Court or Tribunal Ingham Circuit Court STATE OF MICHIGAN IN THE COURT OF APPEALS Cover Sheet

CASE NO. Year Number Case Type
CIRCUIT: 13 734 CZ

COURT OF APPEALS: 317286

Filing Party Last Name or Business/Entity/Agency	Attorney Last Name							
WEBSTER			Canzano					
Filing Party First Name	M.I.		Attorney First Name			M.I. P	Numbe	
GRACIE		John			R 3	30417		
Address (Street 1, Street 2, City, State, and ZIP Code)			Address(Street 1, Street 2, City, State, and ZIP Code)					
			400 Galleria Officentre					
			Suite 117					
			Southfield]	MI 48	3034		
			Attorney Telephone Number					
			(248)354-9650					
Type Filename/l	Description		Filing Fee	Doc Fee		Total This Filing	g	
Other Plaintiffs-	-Appellees Statement Regarding A	Appeal	\$5.00	\$0.00	0	\$5.00		
			3% Service Fe	e:		\$0.15		
Fee Substitute/Alternate Payment			Total All Filings:			\$5.15		
Reason:								
Appointed Counsel								
Motion To Waive Fee								
Fees Waived in this Case								
MI InterAgency Transfer								
No Fee per MCR 7.203(F)(2)								

Filer Office Use Only:

AFSCME Webster

Lower Court or Tribunal	
Ingham Circuit Court	

STATE OF MICHIGAN IN THE COURT OF APPEALS Proof of Service

 CASE NO.
 Year
 Number
 Case Type

 CIRCUIT:
 13
 734
 CZ

 COURT OF APPEALS:
 317286

Case Name: GRACIE WEBSTER V STATE OF MICHIGAN					
On _ 7/2	26/2013 , one copy o	f the follo	wing documents:		
Other	Ther Plaintiffs-Appellees Statement Regarding Appeal				
	vered to the persons listed	below:	Singapore.		
		/s/John R. Canzano			
	<u>-:</u>				
	Name	Delivery Method	Service Address		
	Appellate, AG	E-Serve	paasdivision@michigan.gov		
30417	Canzano, John R	E-Serve	jcanzano@michworklaw.com		
72916	Lindstrom, Aaron D	E-Serve	lindstroma@michigan.gov		
	Meingast, Heather	E-Serve	meingasth@michigan.gov		
	On 7/2 Other was deli Date 7/2 Bar Number	On 7/26/2013 , one copy of Other was delivered to the persons listed Date 7/26/2013 Bar Number Name Appellate, AG 30417 Canzano, John R 72916 Lindstrom, Aaron D	On 7/26/2013 , one copy of the followant of the persons listed below: Date 7/26/2013 Bar Number Name Delivery Method Appellate, AG E-Serve 72916 Lindstrom, Aaron D E-Serve		

COURT OF APPEALS STATE OF MICHIGAN

Gracie Webster, et al v. State of Michigan

Docket No. 317286

LC No. 13-000734-CZ

PLAINTIFFS-APPELLEES STATEMENT REGARDING APPEAL

On July 23, 2013, this Court entered an Order in the this matter "that any answers to the pending application for leave to appeal are due by 5:00 p.m. on Friday, July 26, 2013." Yesterday, July 25, 2013, the United States Bankruptcy Court for the Eastern District of Michigan entered an Order (Docket #166) in *City of Detroit, Michigan*, Case No. 13-53846, that this matter "is stayed, pursuant to section 105(a) of the Bankruptcy Code, pending further Order of this Court." (Order, ¶3 at p 2). Given this Order, it is Plaintiffs-Appellees' understanding that they are precluded at this time from filing a response in opposition to Defendant's Emergency Application for Leave to Appeal. Moreover, and in any event, the July 18, 2013 Temporary Restraining Order which is the subject of this Appeal was quashed by the Circuit Court and expired at 12:15 p.m. on July 19, 2013, and has not been in effect since that time. See July 19 transcript at 35 (Copy attached).

Respectfully submitted,

McKNIGHT, McCLOW, CANZANO, SMITH & RADTKE, P.C.

By: /s/John R. Canzano
John R. Canzano (P30417)
Attorneys for Plaintiffs-Appellees
400 Galleria Officentre, Suite 117
Southfield, MI 48034
248-354-9650
jcanzano@michworklaw.com

Date: July 26, 2013

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on July 26, 2013, I electronically filed the foregoing document with the Clerk of the Court using the ECF system, which will send notification to counsel of record.

/s/ John R. Canzano
JOHN R. CANZANO (P30417)
Attorney for Plaintiffs-Appellees
400 Galleria Officentre, Suite 117
Southfield, MI 48034-8460
(248) 354-9650
jcanzano@kmsmc.com

P:\AFSCME\Emergency Mgr Litigation\Court of Appeals Plaintiff appellee statement.wpd

1	STATE OF MICHIGAN
2	30TH JUDICIAL CIRCUIT COURT FOR THE COUNTY OF INGHAM CIVIL DIVISION
3	
4	GRACIE WEBSTER and VERONICA THOMAS,
5	
6	Plaintiffs, v Case No. 13-734-CZ
7	Hon. Rosemarie Aquilina THE STATE OF MICHIGAN; RICHARD SNYDER, as Governor of the State
8	of Michigan; and ANDY DILLON, as Treasurer of the State of
9	Michigan,
10	Defendants/
11	ROBBIE FLOWERS, MICHAEL WELLS, JANET WHITSON, MARY WASHINGTON, and BRUCE GOLDMAN,
12	Plaintiffs,
13	v Case No. 13-729-CZ
14	Hon. Rosemarie Aquilina RICK SNYDER, as the Governor of the
15	State of Michigan; ANDY DILLON, as the Treasurer of the State of Michigan; and the STATE OF MICHIGAN,
16	Defendants.
17	/
18	MOTION TO AMEND PRELIMINARY INJUNCTION
19	MOTION FOR DEFAULT JUDGMENT
20	MOTION FOR SUMMARY DISPOSITION
21	BEFORE THE HON. ROSEMARIE AQUILINA, CIRCUIT JUDGE
22	Ingham County, Michigan - Friday, July 19, 2013
23	
24	
25	

24

25

is arguing that our case is stayed by the bankruptcy 2 court because we're not suing the Emergency Manager. We're only suing the Governor and the Treasurer and the 4 State of Michigan, and they're not -- they're not in the 5 bankruptcy court. They're not the debtor, so that's an 6 argument that has been raised. But, just for clarity, I 7 7 8 wanted to point that out. That's all I have. 8 9 THE COURT: Thank you. 9 10 Response? 10 MR. DEVLIN: Thank you, your Honor. Brian 11 11 12 Devlin again on behalf of the Defendants. I won't repeat 12 the discussion we had on the Flowers case. Much of that 13 13 14 applies. The relief sought in each of these cases is the 14 15 same position of the State, is that the bankruptcy court 15 16 jurisdiction has a great effect on this, and that the 16 17 reliefs that might be desired by the Plaintiffs are 17 18 available through that court. Furthermore, we'd cite the 18 19 Straus case as well in this reply. 19 20 I would like to call the Court's attention to 20 just one other thing: There was reference made to the 21 21 22 Governor's obligation to uphold the terms of the United 22 23 States -- of the State Constitution but that also applies 23 24 to the United States Constitution, and bankruptcy court 24 25 is certainly someone he may have to answer to as well. 25 1 So that should not be lost sight of. 1 2 Finally, I wanted to point out that we do have 2 3 a motion for summary disposition pending in this case as 4 well. And I would rely on the arguments in the brief. 4 5 And the ones I've just restated as well to ask that that 5 6 relief be granted. Thank you. 6 7 THE COURT: Are you asking that that be heard 7 8 now, or would you like me to make a ruling on that now? 8 9 MR. DEVLIN: I think you could probably make a 9 10 ruling on it without further argument. 10 THE COURT: I think so too. 11 11 12 MR. DEVLIN: All right, 12 13 THE COURT: Okay. 13 MR. DEVLIN: Thank you. 14 14 15 THE COURT: Anything further? 15 16 MR. CANZANO: Nothing further, your Honor. 16 THE COURT: All right. 17 17 As to the motion for summary disposition in 18 18 expires. 19 regard to Defendants' motion is denied. I'm going to 19 20 incorporate the transcript, the arguments of the Flowers 20 matter into this file. I think that in order to have a 21 21 complete argument, we're going to consolidate the 22 22 23 arguments and the files for the purpose of today because

they are really united. They are part and parcel of

13-53846-tit Doc 1221-10 Filed 10/17/13 same arguments. We really can't have a complete

anyone is arguing -- I don't think the Attorney General

transcript without looking at both. 1 So I'm going to direct the court reporter to treat today as one transcript despite there being two docket numbers, and I didn't even call both of them, but we just sort of started, but we're really dealing with Dockets 13-734-CZ and 13-729-CZ. So the motion for summary disposition in regard to 13-734-CZ, and that's Defendants' motion for summary disposition is denied based on the same rationale the Court had and reasoning in the prior case. In regard to the request for declaratory judgment, I think it is imperative that the Court sign this. It's absolutely needed. And the Governor, I have to believe, took his oath in all sincerity to uphold the United States Constitution and the State of Michigan Constitution. I hope he rereads certain sections and reconsiders his actions. I am finding the actions that have been taken in regard to filing this action in the bankruptcy court as overreaching and unconstitutional as it applies to what the Detroit Emergency Manager Kevyn Orr has done in conjunction with the Governor. So I find it absolutely necessary to sign this order of declaratory judgment. I am also going to order, in addition to what you have crafted here, that a copy of this order be forwarded to President Obama. I know that he's watching this, and he's bailed out Detroit. If this is going to ultimately proceed to bankruptcy without anyone paying attention to Michigan's Constitution and to what the legislature drafted and to what the Governor himself signed into law, then there will ultimately be a request that Obama will have to look at the pension, so he might as well follow this. He said in the news that he's following this. He might as well see what we've all done here. It's that important to the State of Michigan and to the thousands of people who will be affected, and ultimately all of the taxpayers of the state of Michigan are going to be affected because we will all have to pick up the tab if this is not honored as it should be. Additionally, I am asked that the temporary restraining order be quashed and nullified, so that is now withdrawn, and it expires today at 12:15. And the order of declaratory judgment is being signed as that Is there anything else for the record? MR. WERTHEIMER: Not for the Plaintiffs in Flowers, your Honor. 23 MR. QUASARANO: I'm obliged, your Honor, to move for a stay of enforcement of the order of Entered 10/17/13 14:22:01 Page 6 of 6 declaratory judgment.